## Case 2:12-cv-042 32 NKL 1030 Wheekt SHE16 T 07/25/12 Page 1 of 9

APPENDIX H

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provice by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiat he civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS WILLIAM CARBO				<b>DEFENDANTS</b> FULTON FRIEDMAN & GULLACE, LLP					
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff PHILADELPHIA  (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)  (c) Attorney's (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) Cary L. Flitter, Esq., and Theodore E. Lorenz, Esq., Flitter Lorenz, P.C., 450 N. Narberth Avenue, Suite 101, Narberth,				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE LAND INVOLVED.  Attorneys (If Known)					
PA 19072, (610) 822-0782  II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" in O	ne Box Only)	I. CIT	IZENSHIP OF P	RINCIE	PAI. PARTIES	Dlogo on "V" in One	D 6 I	D1- : :: CC
□1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	□ 3 Federal Question     (U.S. Government N		PTF	(For Diversity Cases Only	y) 1	<b>DEF</b> ☐ 1 Incorporated or P	and One Box for Principal Place		
U.S. Government		p of Parties in Item III)	Citize	n of Another State	of Business In This  2 Incorporated and of Business In		□ 5		□ 5
	-			n or Subject of a preign Country	□ 3 I	☐ 3 Foreign Nation		□ 6	□ 6
V. NATURE OF SUIT	(Place an "X" in One Box Only	/							
CONTRACT  110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overnavment & Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicare Act 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excl. Veterans) 153 Recovery of Overnavment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholders' Suits 190 Other Contract 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise  REAL PROPERTY 210 Land Condemnation 220 Foreclosure 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY  310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability	PERSONAL INJURY  362 Personal Injury - Med. Malpractice  365 Personal Injury - Product Liability  368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability  PERSONAL PROPERTY  370 Other Fraud  371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage Product Liability  PRISONER PETITIONS  510 Motions to Vacate Sentence Habeas Corpus:  530 General 535 Death Penalty 540 Mandamus & Other 550 Civil Rights  555 Prison Condition	61	O Other Food & Drug Other Food & Drug Other Food & Drug Other Food & Drug Other Food & Seizure Of Property 21 USC 881 O Liduor Laws O R.R. & Truck O Airline Regs. O Occupational Safety/Health Other LABOR O Fair Labor Standards Act O Labor/Mgmt. Relations O Labor/Mgmt. Reporting & Disclosure Act O Railway Labor Act O Other Labor Litigation Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act	422 A   423 W 28   28   28   28   28   28   28   28	ANKRUPTCY Appeal 28 USC 158 Vithdrawal USC 157  PERTY RIGHTS ALSECURITY IIA (1395ff) lack Lung (923) VIWC/DIWW (405(g)) SID Title XVI SI (405(g)) ERAL TAX SUITS axes (U.S. Plaintiff Defendant) 88—Third Party USC 7609	OTHER S	Banking Influence Information	d and s ities/ ons ion Act ers act tion
V. ORIGIN  (Place an "X" in One Box Only)  □ Removed from □ Remanded from Proceeding  (Place an "X" in One Box Only)  Transferred from Appeal to District □									
/I. CAUSE OF ACTION		e under which you are filing FDCPA 15 USC § 1692	д (До п	ot cite jurisdictional st	tatutes un	less diversity):			
TI. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23		CLASS ACTION	DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded JURY DEMAND: \( \times \) Yes		d in complaint ☐ No.				
/III. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY DATE	(See instructions):	JUDGE	NEW C		OOCKET 1	NUMBER			
7/25/12		SIGNATURE OF ATTOR	2/ 2/	RECORD					
OR OFFICE USE ONLY  RECEIPT# AN	<b>I</b> OUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE		MAG, JUDO	BE		

APPENDIX I

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

#### **CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM**

WILLIAM CARBO

CIVIL ACTION

(610) 8 <b>Teleph</b> (Civ.660)	one Fax Number	renz@consumerslaw.con E-Mail Address	n			
7/7 Date	5/12 Attorney at Law	Attorney for Plaintiff				
(f)	Standard Management – Cases that do not fall into any one of the	other tracks.	(	)		
(e)	Special Management – Cases that do not fall into tracks (a) throu commonly referred to as complex and that need special or intense by the court. (See reverse side of this form for a detailed explanate management cases)	management	(	)		
(d)	Asbestos – Cases involving claims for personal injury or property damage from exposure to asbestos.					
(c)	Arbitration - Cases required to be designated for arbitration under	er Local Civil Rule 53.2.	(	X )		
(b)	cial Security – Cases requesting review of a decision of the Secretary of Health d Human Services denying plaintiff Social Security Benefits  ( )					
(a)	Habeas Corpus – Cases brought under 28 U.S.C. §2241 through	§2255.	(	)		
SELE	CT ONE OF THE FOLLOWING CASE MANAGEMENT TR	ACKS:				
plainti filing to side o design the pla	cordance with the Civil Justice Expense and Delay Reduction iff shall complete a case Management Track Designation Form the complaint and serve a copy on all defendants. (See § 1:03 of this form.) In the event that a defendant does not agree whation, that defendant shall, with its first appearance, submit to aintiff and all other parties, a case management track designathat defendant believes the case should be assigned.	n in all civil cases at the first the plan set forth on the vith the plaintiff regards the clerk of court and	he ti he r ding	me of everse g said		
FULTO	ON FRIEDMAN, & GULLACE, LLP : NO.					
	V.					

## 

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

APPENDIX F

FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA — DESIGNATION FORM to be used by counsel to indicate the category of the case for the purpose of assignment to appropriate calendar.

Address of Plaintiff: 1211 Durfor Street, Philadelphia, PA 19148-3513						
Address of Defendant: 28405 Van Dyke Avennue, Warren, MI 48090						
Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction: _1211 Durfor Street, Philadelphia, PA 19148-3513						
(Use Reverse Side For Additional Space)						
Does this civil action involve a nongovernmental corporate party with any parent corp (Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statement Form in accordance with Fed.R.Ci	oration and any publicly held corporation owning 10% or more of its stock?  iv.P. 7.1(a) Yes \( \square\) No \( \square\)					
Does this case involve multidistrict litigation possibilities?	Yes ☐ No ⊠					
RELATED CASE, IF ANY:						
Case Number: Judge	Date Terminated:					
Civil cases are deemed related when yes is answered to any of the following questi						
Is this case related to property included in an earlier numbered suit pending or						
Yes □ No ⊠						
<ol> <li>Does this case involve the same issue of fact or grow out of the same transaction as a prior suit pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court?</li> </ol> Yes ☐ No ☒						
3. Does this case involve the validity or infringement of a patent already in suit or	r any earlier numbered case pending or within one year previously					
terminated action in this court?	Yes □ No ⊠					
CIVIL: (Place ☑ in ONE CATEGORY ONLY)						
A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and All Other Contracts	<ul> <li>B. Diversity Jurisdiction Cases:</li> <li>1.  Insurance Contract and Other Contracts</li> </ul>					
2. ☐ FELA	Airplane Personal Injury					
3.   Jones Act-Personal Injury	3. Assault, Defamation					
4. Antitrust	4. Marine Personal Injury					
5. Patent	5. Motor Vehicle Personal Injury					
6. Labor-Management Relations	6. Other Personal Injury (Please specify)					
7. Civil Rights	7. Products Liability					
8. Habeas Corpus	8. Products Liability (Asbestos)					
9. Securities Act(s) Cases	9. All other Diversity Cases					
10. Social Security Review Cases	(Please specify)					
11.   All other Federal Question Cases	(Tlease specify)					
(Please specify) FDCPA, 15 USC § 1692						
ARBITRATION ( (Check approp	CERTIFICATION oriate Category)					
I,, counsel of record do hereby certify:  Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Section 3(c)(2), that to the best of my knowledge and belief, the damages recoverable in this civil action case exceed the sum of \$150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs;						
Relief other than monetary damages is sought						
DATE:						
Attorney-at-Law	Attorney I.D.					
<b>NOTE:</b> A trial de novo will be a trial by jury on	ly if there has been compliance with F.R.C.P. 38.					
certify that, to my knowledge, the within case is not related to any case now pass noted above.	pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court except					
DATE: 7/25/12 1. 107795						
CIV,609 (4/03) Attorney-at-Law	Attorney I.D.					

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

WILLIAM CARBO 1211 Durfor Street Philadelphia, PA 19148-3513

Plaintiff,

VS.

CIVIL ACTION NO.

FULTON FRIEDMAN & GULLACE, LLP 28405 Van Dyke Avenue Warren, MI 48090

Defendant.

### **COMPLAINT**

#### I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

- 1. This is an action for damages brought by a consumer pursuant to the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 ("FDCPA").
- 2. The FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from engaging in deceptive and unfair practices in the collection of a consumer debt.
- 3. Defendant is subject to strict liability for sending a collection letter which violates the provisions of the FDCPA.

#### II. <u>JURISDICTION</u>

4. Jurisdiction arises under 15 U.S.C. § 1692k, and 28 U.S.C. § 1337.

#### III. PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff William J. Carbo ("Plaintiff") is a consumer who resides in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania at the address captioned.
- 6. Defendant Fulton Friedman & Gullace LLP ("Fulton Friedman") is a collection law firm with an office for the regular transaction of business at the address captioned.
- 7. Defendant regularly engages in the collection of consumer debts in the Eastern District of Pennsylvania using the mails and telephone.
  - 8. Defendant regularly attempts to collect consumer debts alleged to be due another.
- 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as that term is contemplated in the FDCPA, 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

#### IV. STATEMENT OF CLAIM

- 10. On August 3, 2011, Fulton Friedman sent Plaintiff a form collection letter in an attempt to collect a consumer debt alleged due its client. A copy of the August 3, 2011 letter is attached hereto as Exhibit A (redacted in part per Fed. R. Civ. 5.2).
  - 11. The August 3, 2011 collection letter is on the letterhead of:

# FULTON FRIEDMAN & GULLACE, LLP Collections, Consulting & Litigation

- 12. The August 3, 2011 collection letter states in part:
  - "[Y]our unpaid account listed above has been referred to our office for collection. Disregard of this notice may result in the commencement of legal proceedings against you for collection of this debt. Note that if a lawsuit is commenced, the Court may assess additional charges for the court costs and other expenses of the lawsuit."
- 13. The August 3, 2011 collection dun is signed by "Fulton Friedman & Gullace, LLP".

- 14. The August 3, 2011 collection letter from Fulton Friedman represents or implies a level of attorney involvement in the sending of the collection letter. However, there was no such involvement.
- 15. In reality, and unbeknownst to the consumer, Fulton Friedman sends this form collection letter in its capacity as a debt collector only and not as a law firm acting like a real law firm should.
- 16. The sentence in the August 3, 2011 collection letter, "[A]t this time, no attorney with this firm has personally reviewed the particular circumstances of your account", does not ameliorate the effect of the collection letter sent on attorney letterhead.
- 17. The FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representations or means in connection with the collection of any debt. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

#### **COUNT I - FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT**

- 18. Plaintiff repeats the allegations contained above as if the same were here set forth at length.
- 19. The acts by Defendant described above violated the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act by using false, deceptive, or misleading representations or means in connection with the collection of any debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e, § 1692e(3) and § 1692e(10).

**WHEREFORE**, Plaintiff William J. Carbo demands judgment against Defendant Fulton Friedman & Gullace, LLP, for:

- (a) Damages;
- (b) Attorney's fees and costs; and
- (c) Such other and further relief as the Court shall deem just and proper.

3

## V. <u>DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL</u>

Plaintiff demands a trial by jury as to all issues so triable.

Respectfully submitted:

Date: 7/25/12

CARY L. FLITTER THEODORE E. LORENZ

ANDREW M. MILZ Attorneys for Plaintiff

FLITTER LORENZ, P.C. 450 N. Narberth Avenue Suite 101
Narberth, PA 19072

(610) 822-0781

4

# EXHIBIT "A"

# FULTON FRIEDMAN & GULLACE, LLP

COLLECTIONS, CONSULTING & LITIGATION

ECCENSEC IN APPORIA CALIFORNIA, DISTRICT OF COUNTRIA MARYLAND, MICHIGAN, NEW YORK PENINSYLVACIA, TENNESSELL & TEXAS

PÚ BOX 2 123 WARREN, MI 46090-2 123 FOLL PREE 877-496-4802 EXT. 0

August 3, 2011

Re: Asset Acceptance, LLC Assignee of WACHOVIA CARD SERVICES Original Creditor Acct #: XXXXXXXXXXXXX2932

Fulton, Friedman & Gullace, LLP Acct #: 11-17

Balance Due: \$

Dear William J Carbo:

Your unpaid account listed above has been referred to our office for collection. Disregard of this notice may result in the commencement of legal proceedings against you for collection of this debt. Note that if a lawsuit is commenced, the Court may assess additional charges for the court costs and other expenses of the lawsuit.

At this time, no attorney with this firm has personally reviewed the particular circumstances of your account.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this claim or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt to be valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request of this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

This is an attempt to collect a debt by a debt collector. Any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

Very truly yours,

Dave Smith Collections Team (Non-Attorney) Phone: 877-496-4802 Ext. 0 Fulton, Friedman & Gullace, LLP

\*\*\*Detach Lower Portion and Return with Payment\*\*\*

CCGASSE02\_OS\_0100



PO Box 2124 Warren MI 48090-2124 ADDRESS SERVICE REQUESTED Fulton, Friedman & Gullace, LLP Acct #: 11-17
Balance Due: \$

August 3, 2011

Fulton, Friedman & Gullace, LLP PO Box 2123 Warren MI 48090-2123